From: Borinsky, Susan <FTA>

To: Welbes, Matt <FTA>; Cefalo, Nancy <FTA>

CC: Matley, Ted <FTA>; Sukys, Raymond <FTA>; Rogers, Leslie <FTA>; Carranza, Edward <FTA>;

VanWyk, Christopher <FTA>; Barr, James <FTA>

Sent: 3/16/2009 3:00:27 PM

Subject: FW: Slater appointment with Mr. Welbes

Attachments: slater.doc

Matt--Here's the draft response, prepared by Joe Ossi, which TPE has prepared to send to Mr. Slater. Are you ok with this? We think that the appropriate signature is Jim Barr, the HQ person most acquainted with the Honolulu environmental review.

Leslie, Ed, Ray and Ted: By this e-maill I am asking Region IX to send a reply e-mail to concur on this letter.

Chris—same goes for TCC concurrence.

Thanks to all. Susan

From: Rogers, Leslie <FTA>

Sent: Monday, March 16, 2009 2:41 PM

To: Borinsky, Susan <FTA>

Cc: Ryan, James <FTA>; Carranza, Edward <FTA>; Marler, Renee <FTA>; Matley, Ted <FTA>; Sukys, Raymond <FTA>; VanWyk, Christopher <FTA>; Barr, James <FTA>; Ossi, Joseph <FTA>; Day, Elizabeth <FTA>; Weeks, Dwayne <FTA>;

Cefalo, Nancy <FTA>; Riklin, Sherry <FTA>

Subject: RE: appointment for phone call with Mr. Welbes

Susan,

Thanks for your message. In this instance, I would appreciate if you or someone there in HQs would respond to Mr. Slater as his request was directed there (initially to Jim Ryan).

Leslie

From: Borinsky, Susan <FTA>

Sent: Monday, March 16, 2009 11:28 AM

To: Cefalo, Nancy <FTA>; Rogers, Leslie <FTA>; Riklin, Sherry <FTA>

Cc: Ryan, James <FTA>; Carranza, Edward <FTA>; Marler, Renee <FTA>; Matley, Ted <FTA>; Sukys, Raymond <FTA>; VanWyk, Christopher <FTA>; Barr, James <FTA>; Ossi, Joseph <FTA>; Day, Elizabeth <FTA>; Weeks, Dwayne <FTA>

Subject: RE: appointment for phone call with Mr. Welbes

Leslie, I agree completely with your note below.

Normally at HQ when we get phone, letter or e-mail requests of this sort, we send a brief written response to the complaining citizen to say that FTA welcomes comments on the NEPA document. We receive and address those comments within the framework of the NEPA process (i.e., FTA receives public comments on the DEIS, considers them, then addresses them in the FEIS). We do not meet with individuals during NEPA reviews, but rely on the NEPA system, which is designed to ensure full opportunity for comments on proposed projects, and to maintain consistent treatment of all comments on the documents..

Leslie, if you agree with this approach, do you want to respond to Mr. Slater on behalf of Matt Welbes, or shall I? Usually the Region responds since the documents are ultimately signed by the Regional Administrator. Joe Ossi or Dwayne Weeks probably can find an example of the letters we have sent in similar circumstances to share with you.

Susan

From: Cefalo, Nancy <FTA>

Sent: Monday, March 16, 2009 2:11 PM

To: Rogers, Leslie <FTA>; Borinsky, Susan <FTA>; Riklin, Sherry <FTA>

Cc: Ryan, James <FTA>; Carranza, Edward <FTA>; Marler, Renee <FTA>; Matley, Ted <FTA>; Sukys, Raymond <FTA>;

VanWyk, Christopher <FTA>; Barr, James <FTA>; Ossi, Joseph <FTA>

Subject: RE: appointment for phone call with Mr. Welbes

I kind of got that with the tone of his e-mail. Thanks Leslie.

From: Rogers, Leslie <FTA>

Sent: Monday, March 16, 2009 1:58 PM

To: Cefalo, Nancy <FTA>; Borinsky, Susan <FTA>; Riklin, Sherry <FTA>

Cc: Ryan, James <FTA>; Carranza, Edward <FTA>; Marler, Renee <FTA>; Matley, Ted <FTA>; Sukys, Raymond <FTA>;

VanWyk, Christopher <FTA>; Barr, James <FTA>; Ossi, Joseph <FTA>

Subject: RE: appointment for phone call with Mr. Welbes

We definitely do NOT want to involve Matt in this matter. Mr. Slater, a long standing opponent to the project, is well known to Region IX and TPE staff. He is factually **incorrect** that "the recent Draft EIS was found acceptable by FTA" as the comment period on the DEIS closed in early February and the City currently is reviewing the numerous comments received. In fact, representatives of the City and its environmental consultant were in San Francisco last week and met with Region IX staff and visited with local DOI and EPA staff. While not trying to play lawyer here, I believe any involvement at this point with Mr. Slater might constitute an "ex parte" communication and should be avoided. Thanks!

Leslie

From: Cefalo, Nancy <FTA>

Sent: Monday, March 16, 2009 10:40 AM

To: Borinsky, Susan <FTA>; Riklin, Sherry <FTA>; Rogers, Leslie <FTA>

Subject: FW: appointment for phone call with Mr. Welbes

FYI – can someone contact him? Maybe you already have. I didn't think I had to involve Matt at this point. If I do, please let me know.

From: Cliff Slater [mailto:cliffslater@hawaii.rr.com]

Sent: Friday, March 13, 2009 2:34 PM

To: Cefalo, Nancy <FTA>

Subject: appointment for phone call with Mr. Welbes

Nancy:

This is to request a brief phone conversation with Mr. Welbes preferably during this coming week regarding the Honolulu High Capacity Transit Project.

Our organization, <u>HONOLULUTRAFFIC.COM</u>, which I Chair, has over 700 members, and is one of many Hawaii organizations opposed to an elevated rail running through the center of our city.

We are perplexed as to why the recent Draft EIS was found acceptable by FTA when it is so legally and factually deficient. Our comments alone took 67 pages just to cover the worst of its errors. We are concerned that this project is being pushed through without regard for the concerns of our residents, or even the requirements of NEPA.

We have tried frequently to contact Mr. Ryan on this matter without result.

Cliff Slater

Ph: 808.524.5619 Cell: 808.285.7799 www.honolulutraffic.com